



# Employee Directorship, Corporate Performance and Reporting Practices: A Cross-country Study

Dissertation presented to obtain the degree of Doctor in Business Economics

by

**Phuong Nguyen Trang Doan**

---

Daar de proefschriften in de reeks van de Faculteit Economie en  
Bedrijfswetenschappen het persoonlijk werk zijn van hun auteurs,  
zijn alleen deze laatsten daarvoor verantwoordelijk.

---

## **Doctoral Committee**

---

### **Supervisors**

Prof. Dr. Ann Gaeremynck – KU Leuven

Prof. Dr. Piet Sercu – KU Leuven

### **Members**

Prof. Dr. Bert D’Espallier – KU Leuven

Prof. Dr. Kurt Desender – University Carlos III Madrid

Prof. Dr. Mathijs Van Peteghem – Maastricht University

Prof. Dr. Tom Van Caneghem – KU Leuven

### **Chairperson**

Prof. Dr. Gunther Wuyts – KU Leuven



---

## Acknowledgements

---

Finally, my most awaited day has come; yes, it's my Graduation Day. Five years ago, when knowing that I was granted a national scholarship to study a Ph.D. abroad, I was struggling mightily with ambivalence: go for it or not? At that time, my son was only two and a half years old. That made it so hard for me to decide to leave him. It took me one year to make a final decision. With support and encouragement from my husband, I left my family in tears for Leuven in October 2016. My first year at KU Leuven was fully covered by academic pressure, loneliness, and homesickness. I overwhelmingly yearned to get through that year in a hope that I could visit my family more often from my second year onward. Now, as four years passed by, I realize that I did make a good decision. I have learned a lot, not only about how to do research but also on how to be a good researcher. Also, these past four years I did a lot of growing up and I came to understand and love academia even more. It has been a very challenging journey along with a lot of help, support, and wisdom of many people to make it through to the end. I would like to express my sincere gratitude to all of you for what you have done for me.

First and foremost, I would like to thank Prof. Gaeremynck and Prof. Sercu for their patience and their continuous support during my

---

Ph.D. study. I will never forget the moment when I came to Piet's office in tears to seek his advice after my original supervisor suddenly stopped her service. Then, coincidentally, Ann joined our conversation. She said: "Don't cry, Phuong. We know your situation. We can help you do better." These words are resonating in my head whenever I face difficulties. It's like a big motivation for me to overcome obstacles in academia. You two took me to a new path on my Ph.D. journey. I am sincerely thankful to you for arousing my passion for doing research. It is no longer a must-to-do for me, but a thing I love to do. (◡) I have learned a lot from you, both professionally and personally. The quarantine time due to Covid19 is an unforgettable time for me in Leuven. I literally did not live in entire solitude during that quarantine time because Ann and Piet emailed me every day to check on my situation and to motivate me to overcome such a hard time. I tremendously appreciate how you have given me so many opportunities and trust to help me feel confident in my abilities. I could not have imagined having better advisors and mentors for my Ph.D. study. I am forever thankful.

To Ann: I would like to express my special appreciation and thanks to you. I am really amazed by how approachable you are to your students. I was very moved when you told me not to limit our conversation within our projects. Then we shared stories with each other about our family, especially about the cultural difference between Vietnam and Belgium. Thank you for always being there for me to talk, whether it was about research, or something else. Thanks to you, I was granted a top-up scholarship funded by KU Leuven so as to ease the financial burden on my husband's shoulder. After that dream-like event, my Vietnamese AFI colleague told me that I was like a "Cinderella" in a fairy tale.(◡) I have received an abundance of your care about my family's situation in Vietnam during the Covid19 pandemic. I feel how immensely warm-hearted you are. Working with you is a big pleasure for me. My research skills improved a lot every time I received your sharp comments and questions. The "always-harsh-reviewer" role that you play in our meetings in fact brings us to a much better approach to proceed with our papers. It wouldn't

---

have been possible for me to finish my Ph.D. on time without your precious support.

To Piet: please accept my great sense of gratitude towards you for being my L<sup>A</sup>T<sub>E</sub>X, econometrics and English-writing mentor. Our meetings and conversations were vital in inspiring me to think outside the box, from multiple perspectives to form a comprehensive and objective critique. You always provide me with insightful comments and recommendations every step of the research process so that my Doctoral thesis is filled with a combination of many alternative methodologies, especially reflected in our invention of dual-IMR Heckman.(◡) Without your tireless help and support, I could not have finished this dissertation that well. I could (and can) always come to you with questions in research, and I was really happy I could do the same with any questions related to Belgian culture, history, and even music. Every time I listen to your song ‘Leave her’, I always dream of my graduation day excitedly and joyfully. I have become increasingly fixated on Leuven because of you. I am so touched with a lot of motivation that you have given to me. You made my colleagues jealously look at the huge monitor on my desk, which motivates me to work in the office all the time, even at weekends. The greatest motivation you gave me for my academic career is the chance to participate in an honorary doctorate ceremony at UC Louvain in Louvain-la-Neuve. The solemnity of the event enlightened me a lot about my future career.

To Prof. Huyghebaert: over our many meetings during the writing of our joint paper I have learned a lot from you. You are the person who accompanied me to go my first step in my Ph.D. study. It must have been so hard for you to supervise a “freshman” Ph.D. student, who could not express herself properly, like me. You were there to correct my mistakes and give me generous support so that I could complete my first Doctoral seminar successfully. Thank you so much for being there during my first two years in Leuven. For some reasons, our joint paper is not included in this dissertation, but to me, it is always one part of my Ph.D.

Next, I would like to thank the rest of my doctoral committee. To

---

Mathijs: I am sincerely grateful to you for your support during my Ph.D. journey. Your dedication to high-quality research has always inspired me a lot. I will never forget the post-it note you left on my desk that day: “Hi Phuong. Thank you for the hard work! You did very well.” I was overwhelmingly happy at the moment of seeing that note. Since then the note is always stuck to the huge monitor in my office as a source of motivation for me to keep going. To Tom and Bert: as the internal members of the committee, you were there from the start. In each of my Doctoral seminars, you always gave me not only your insightful comments but also constructive questions that enabled me to see through the weaknesses of the papers. I am very thankful for that. To Kurt: I highly appreciate your acceptance to be a member of my Doctoral committee. Your involvement in the process has been short but intense. It was fantastic for me to receive your excellent feedback at my preliminary defense, from which then the thesis has greatly benefited. To Gunther: thank you for willingly chairing my Doctoral committee. Though having less chance to work with you, you made a deep impression on me for your nice way of giving feedback to presenters in every seminar you have attended.

Furthermore, I would like to express my sincere gratitude to the Head of my Accounting Faculty at the University of Economics, University of Danang - Prof. Phi Anh, who set me off on the road to this Ph.D journey. Thank you for encouraging me to take the first step for my overseas Ph.D study by applying for the Vietnamese government’s national scholarship program. Now I truly realize that studying a Ph.D abroad is a very fruitful and meaningful path towards a promising future career.

Doing a Ph.D. was extremely lonely in my first two years, spending hours at my desk studying, reading papers, and struggling with data in the common office, where only I showed up most of the work-days. Thankfully, the situation changed from the third year of my Ph.D. on, when I moved to a shared office with the three great colleagues who helped me become sociable a bit. To Kristof: thank you for believing in me even when I doubted myself. There is no doubt that you are the kindest and smartest office-mate I have ever met. You



---

are a person who always encourages me to close the distance between me and the other AFIs by joining lunch and other AFIs activities. I am also inspired by your dedication and endurance. Although you started your Ph.D. two years later than me, I learned a lot from you. To Shao-qing: since we shared a common situation (all alone and without any relatives in Leuven), we helped each other a lot. Thanks to your presence till late at night in our office, I could fearlessly stay and work longer than before. Your accompanying drove away my loneliness and somehow shortened the normal length of my days in Leuven. To Lotte: even though we have known each other for just a short time, I was very happy to have you in our office. You filled our demanding working environment with lots of joy and laughter.

There are some colleagues in particular that I would like to express my thanks to. Hien, my time at the AFI department would have been very different without you. You are the only one here that I can talk to in Vietnamese. I am very thankful to you for giving me the information that I need to know. I appreciate how much you have helped me get out of my loneliness and widen my comfort zone by joining you in some parties. To Wouter: I am so amazed at how hard-working and dedicated to your research you are and yet you still have time to chat with me about my daily life. I was so moved when you asked me about my father's situation. You actively gave me useful advice to help me get over my sadness. Thank you for giving me a priceless history painting of Leuven. Every time I look at the painting, it brings me back to my happy student life in Leuven. To Mieke: thanks a lot for willingly being my cheerleader all the time I had to present my papers. Your cheerleading became a great source of strength to me. Dieter, I'm very impressed by your great sense of humor. Mieke and I had a fun and laughful time with you during our Barcelona EDEN course. Thank you for accompanying me during that memorable trip. To Carola, Liliana, Maxim and Victor: from the first day I moved to my re-allocated office, you all were there welcoming me. You all have not stopped being your friendly selves ever since. Thank you for being a bridge to connect me with other AFIs. To Ditmir: I am so thankful to you for our nice conversations during the quarantine time.

---

Thank you for motivating me to muster up courage to communicate confidently with others.

Certainly there are many more colleagues I have enjoyed my time with over the past four years. My time at AFI was made enjoyable thanks to such a warm and friendly AFI research group. This is one of the factors sometimes arousing my desire to have a longer stay at KU Leuven. I love it to have a fun chat with you over lunch, to enjoy Belgian pies together every AFI Thursday Morning Tea break, to go grab a drink for our monthly Happy Hour at STUK, to help each other to get over difficult research problems, and to be like a family. I will always treasure the time I have had with AFIs, especially my farewell party. Though being constrained by Covid19 restriction measures, you all came there – the Oude Markt – for bidding farewell to me. That made me so touched and emotional.

Next, I would like to say a special thanks to my family for all their love and encouragement. Words cannot express how grateful I am to my mother, father, and my mother-in-law, father-in-law, for all of the sacrifices that you've made. For my parents, thank you for raising me with love and always supporting me in all my pursuits. For my parents in-law, thank you for tirelessly taking care of my husband and my son during my far-from-home study. My success today is directly attributed to your love and the prayers you always kept doing for me.

Last but not least, my biggest thanks go to my beloved, supportive, encouraging, and patient husband Phuoc Minh, who sacrificed his happiness and compromised his wishes so that I could fulfill mine. I highly appreciate your many sleepless nights to take care of our son when he got sick and kept calling mom. Thank you for always inciting me to strive towards my goal through all the ups and downs. Thank you is a small word for all that you have done for me. My success is truly yours. I would never have got my Doctoral degree without your continuous support from the beginning till the end. To my son Anh Quan: I always felt guilty for not being with you when you were in need over the past four years. Thank you for being such a good boy that always cheered me up. I love you with all my heart.

---

The past four years have been a challenging journey, and its happy ending is approaching. I sometimes wondered whether I was going to make it happen, and each of those times someone was there to help me keep going and move forward. Thank you to everyone for being with me along this journey. The last words I'd like to say here is that all of you are more than welcome to visit Vietnam. It's my pleasure to be your guide.

♡ ♡ ♡ (◡) (◡) (◡) ♡ ♡ ♡

Phuong Nguyen Trang Doan

September 2020.



# Contents

<b>General Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>1 Board-level Employee Representation and Corporate Social- Environmental and Financial Performance</b>	<b>9</b>
1.1 Introduction . . . . .	10
1.2 Theory and hypotheses . . . . .	16
1.2.1 The role of board-level employee representation	16
1.2.2 Board-level employee representation and social- environmental performance . . . . .	18
1.2.3 Board-level employee representation and fi- nancial performance . . . . .	22
1.2.4 Mandatory versus voluntary board-level em- ployee representation . . . . .	24
1.3 Data and research design . . . . .	27
1.3.1 Sample and data . . . . .	27
1.3.2 Research design . . . . .	29
1.3.2.1 Variables: definition and measure- ment . . . . .	29
1.3.2.2 Descriptives: total sample and ERB/non- ERB sub-samples . . . . .	38
1.3.2.3 Endogeneity issues: an overview .	42
1.3.2.4 Model specifications . . . . .	44
1.4 Empirical results . . . . .	49
1.4.1 Single-IMR Heckman . . . . .	50
1.4.2 Dual-IMR Heckman . . . . .	53
1.4.3 Entropy balancing . . . . .	56

---

1.4.4	Interpreting the economic significance of ERB effect . . . . .	56
1.5	Additional analysis . . . . .	60
1.5.1	Sub-categories of social and environmental performance . . . . .	60
1.5.2	Does the number of employee directors on boards matter? . . . . .	62
1.5.3	Does the share ownership of employee directors matter? . . . . .	63
1.5.4	How do EDs interact with other members in board room? A coalition story . . . . .	64
1.6	Sensitivity analysis . . . . .	68
1.7	Discussion and conclusion . . . . .	69
<b>2</b>	<b>Aggressiveness in Corporate Financial and Tax Reporting: Do Employee Directors Matter?</b>	<b>73</b>
2.1	Introduction . . . . .	74
2.2	Hypothesis development . . . . .	82
2.2.1	Aggressiveness in financial and tax reporting as managerial opportunistic behavior . . . . .	82
2.2.2	EDs act as monitoring and disciplining agents towards managers . . . . .	84
2.2.3	EDs' own agenda is to ensure employees' morale	88
2.2.4	EDs' own agenda is to form opportunistic payroll oriented alliance with managers . . . . .	93
2.2.5	EDs are basically powerless in matters of reporting aggressiveness . . . . .	95
2.3	Data and research design . . . . .	96
2.3.1	Sample and data . . . . .	96
2.3.2	Definition and measurement of regressees . . . . .	98
2.3.2.1	Accruals management . . . . .	99
2.3.2.2	Delayed loss recognition . . . . .	101
2.3.2.3	Real-activities management . . . . .	103
2.3.2.4	Corporate aggressiveness in tax reporting – Tax aggressiveness . . . . .	105
2.3.3	Definition and measurement of regressors . . . . .	106

2.3.3.1	Board-level employee representation indicator . . . . .	106
2.3.3.2	Control variables . . . . .	106
2.3.4	Descriptives: total sample and ERB/non-ERB sub-sample . . . . .	109
2.3.5	Model specifications . . . . .	112
2.4	Main empirical results . . . . .	117
2.4.1	Single-IMR Heckman . . . . .	117
2.4.2	Dual-IMR Heckman . . . . .	121
2.4.3	Propensity Score Matching – PSM . . . . .	123
2.5	Additional analysis . . . . .	125
2.5.1	Does it matter whether ERB is a free choice versus imposed by law? . . . . .	125
2.5.2	Does the number of employee directors on boards matter? . . . . .	128
2.5.3	Does the share ownership of employee directors matter? . . . . .	129
2.5.4	Does the composition of the board matter? . . . . .	130
2.5.5	The Dechow <i>et al.</i> 's <i>F</i> -score for the <i>ex ante</i> likelihood of fraudulent reporting: Do EDs matter? . . . . .	134
2.6	Sensitivity analysis . . . . .	137
2.7	Discussion and conclusion . . . . .	137
	<b>General Conclusion</b>	<b>143</b>
	<b>Bibliography</b>	<b>145</b>
	<b>Appendix</b>	<b>161</b>
A.1	Description of Thomson Reuters Eikon ESG Score and its categories . . . . .	161
A.2	Inverse Mills Ratios . . . . .	166
A.2.1	Standard single-IMR Heckman estimation . . . . .	166
A.2.2	The dual-IMR Heckman estimation . . . . .	167





# List of Tables

Table 1.1	Board-level employee representation worldwide	30
Table 1.2	Variables definition, measures and data sources (1): performance measures	31
Table 1.3	Variables definition, measures and data sources (2): regressors	32
Table 1.4	Descriptive statistics	37
Table 1.5	Univariate analysis – ERB firms vs. non-ERB firms	39
Table 1.6	Univariate analysis – voluntary vs. mandatory	40
Table 1.7	Summary of main empirical results	50
Table 1.8	Single-IMR Heckman estimates of the relation between ERB and company performance	54
Table 1.9	Dual-IMR Heckman estimates of the relation between ERB and company performance	57
Table 1.10	Entropy balancing – Single-IMR Heckman estimates of the relation between ERB and company performance	58
Table 1.11	Estimated effect on Tobin’s $Q$ of 4.4 opr 3.6 percent extra ROA over $N$ discounted years at $R$ , assuming growth $g$ /yr in total assets.	60
Table 1.12	Single-IMR Heckman estimates: relation between ERB and components of performance scores	62
Table 1.13	Single-IMR Heckman estimates: relation between ERB and performance with EDs’ characteristics and interactions with governance characteristics	65
Table 1.14	Summary of main empirical results – Sample of countries with ERB firms	68

---

Table 2.1	Summary of predictions and main empirical results . . . . .	78
Table 2.2	Board-level employee representation worldwide	97
Table 2.3	Variables definition, measures and data sources (1): regressees . . . . .	100
Table 2.4	Variables definition, measures and data sources (2): regressors . . . . .	107
Table 2.5	Descriptive statistics . . . . .	110
Table 2.6	Univariate analysis – ERB firms vs. non-ERB firms . . . . .	111
Table 2.7	Single-IMR Heckman estimates of the relation between ERB and corporate aggressiveness in financial and tax reporting . . . . .	119
Table 2.8	Dual-IMR Heckman estimates of the relation between ERB and corporate aggressiveness in financial and tax reporting . . . . .	122
Table 2.9	PSM estimates of the relation between ERB and corporate aggressiveness in financial and tax reporting . . . . .	124
Table 2.10	Summary of additional analysis: voluntary versus mandatory . . . . .	128
Table 2.11	Single-IMR Heckman estimates of the relation between ERB and corporate aggressiveness in financial and tax reporting: EDs’ characteristics and interactions with governance characteristics . . . . .	133
Table 2.12	Estimates of the relation between ERB and fraudulent reporting ( <i>F</i> -score) . . . . .	136
Table 2.13	Summary of main empirical results – sample of countries with ERB firms . . . . .	137
Table A.1	Components of Eikon’s Environmental/ Social/ Governance Index . . . . .	163